| **Student Name:** Maddie |
| --- |

| **Motion:** THW replace standardised testing with ho |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow) | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for a child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Speaking time: 05:01:56, nice!   * Nice hook! (Though try to avoid the H word though - I will let it slide this time since it was a good usage of the word.) * Make sure that you are signposting! For example, tell me when you are heading into your policy, etc. * Good policy set-up! * You might want to start by telling me what is wrong with the current methods of retaining a teacher; why should things like personality and or demeanour be taken into account when someone is still doing their professional duties? (E.g., a mean teacher can still be a very capable teacher in terms of marking, etc.) * Good use of personal examples! * Try to make sure that you are explaining how things change with this feedback. I know it might seem obvious in this context, but it may not be so clear to the judge! Plus, there is a possibility of the Opposition hurting you by saying that this causes teachers to not want to discipline students anymore. * Be sure to push the Opposition to defend a harder burden! Put your opponents on the defensive.   Speaking time: | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Tania |
| --- |

| **Motion:** THW replace standardised testing with holistic learning in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student offered a point of information. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; they exceed expectations for a child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Speaking time: 05:45.24. Good work! Let’s aim for 6 minute speech.   * Nice hook and dramaticism! Good engagement with the crowd. * Try to make sure that you are going into details about how your project based learning will work; how many assessments might you have? How would you be assessed? These are important questions of clarity that should be answered. * I like the skills you identified; but I’d like for you to build them more. For example, when you say it teaches leadership - how specifically? Tell me the steps! * Good answer to the POI; you could also answer and say that you can actually learn to cope with stress in a healthier manner. Perhaps through trying and failing as compared to hoping for the best from a single exam. * I feel that you could have weaponised the characterisation of exams and assessments more; for example, you mentioned kids wouldn’t be happy. Why is happiness important for students? What is the effect of this? * Good impact work; much better this speech. If you wanna level up your impacts, you can actually go ahead and focus them on a specific actor. For example, if you’re talking about students, you could focus on a specific type of student, like a non-academically inclined student, a poor student etc. This helps bring richness to your speech! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Alvina |
| --- |

| **Motion:** THW replace standardised testing with holistic learning in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow) | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; they exceed expectations for a child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Speaking time: 07:48.51, good work!   * Good focus on the hook on why this doesn’t allow for students to thrive in the future. Try to focus in here with some impact on how they won’t be able to adapt; does this result in coddled adults who give up easily? Who doesn't reach their full potential? * Excellent response to the POI; I think you want to make sure that you are going into why that comparison and “benchmark” for knowing how you perform relative to other schools and countries is important. You can say this is because we need to know as the government, so that we can identify failures in policy. * I think you had some really good comparisons between the two systems; make sure that you tell me why that knowledge retention is super important. It is important because it genuinely helps develop you as a person! * You could also go further to say that this system places a lot of burden on their children; because compared to the usual studying and taking a test, we now expect children to take on numerous projects at a given time. That seems a lot more stressful - so don’t let the other side get away with being the anti-stress team! * You did really well in terms of illustrating how difficult this is going to be for teachers - good work! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Aria |
| --- |

| **Motion:** THW replace standardised testing with holistic learning in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student offered a point of information. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for a child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Speaking time: 07:03.22, good work!   * Nice hook! Try to make use of comedic timing next time around. That would help with the perception of the hook! * Rebuttals; you want to be careful about this! It sounded like you mentioned that dropping out of school might be a good thing. But that is objectively a good thing! * Good acknowledgement of the fairness of the POI; I think you can actually go into quite a few reasons for why students should not deal with anxiety at such a young age. It could be because children are not emotionally mature yet; which is something they are likely to be in college! * I feel like a lot of the outcomes/impacts were a bit vague; this looks like telling me that a PBL project helps you become more worldly or get more leadership; but what does this look like actually? What is the practical outcome of this? * I think you need to start doing the comparison between the two systems the way the first opposition speaker did; for example, I understood that your system has its own benefits independently, but I wasn’t sure why your system would be better compared to the other! * Try to make sure that you are telling me the step by step process for how PBL will get students to where you say they will be at. For example, when you said that it would help a kid become more independent in their work, but how do we get there? * Summary; focus on the process next time around! Additionally, I felt that the rebuttals were not as engaging as it could have been - there was still a lot of analysis left on the table about how stress was beneficial and necessary! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Kyle |
| --- |

| **Motion:** THW replace standardised testing with holistic learning in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student offered a point of information. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for a child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Speaking time: 06:22.06, good work!   * I appreciate the hook; but it seems a bit extreme to suggest that people might not know how to count without taking an exam. * Good signposting! I appreciate the control and flow you had throughout it. * Give me more details! For example, when you mentioned that exams provide you with more skills, tell me what those skills are and why the way you teach people these skills is far superior! * I think the whole aspect of being a houseleader etc was actually super underrated; because a lot of what the other side was talking about assumed that students don’t get the opportunity to develop non-academic skills. But there are extracurricular activities already! * Try not to pause for too long during a POI; Try to take a sip of water or etc to buy yourself some time! That said, good answer. * I think you need to make sure that you are refreshing your argumentation structure; this speech felt quite undirected. Undirected in this context means that you are saying a lot of good things without necessarily attaching it to a grand outcome or narrative. You gotta make sure you know where you are heading in your analysis! * I’m not sure about this real world-application angle; because the other side has convinced me quite a bit that they will exclusively teach people leadership skills etc. Perhaps you want to defend focusing on academics? This is fine to do as academia is a completely different but important skill. | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Maddie |
| --- |

| **Motion:** THW replace standardised testing with holistic learning in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student offered a point of information. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for a child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Speaking time: 07:18.42, good work!   * Nice hook! I like the use of your tone and the pauses you were able to pull off. I also didn’t see the AI angle coming! * Good control and pacing in your speech; but, I think conceding that standardised testing will exist to some extent was a bad idea. The reason for this is because it shows that you guys agree with the other side! Plus, it reduces your benefit since you guys were talking about all the harms of standardised testing - and now that harm applies to you as well! * I think you have good illustrations for why the feedback from standardised testing isn’t great; you want to take this further to say that there is no focus on emotional intelligence, which means that our kids aren’t being taught to communicate effectively. What is the implication of that? * I appreciate the focus on teachers having fun; but is this the most important angle? It could be, but you gotta show me why it is the most important angle! * I think you have a lot of good hooks and sayings in this speech; but I would like to see you grind out more direct reasons for why you are better. For example, when you suggest that a child isn’t going to get the stimulation they need, give me three reasons immediately for why and go into why you need that stimulation. Your current style is fine, but will be elevated even more with this! * An example of a hook that sounds good but isn’t proving anything; Children should have the right to pursue their dreams. I agree, but you gotta tell me how or else I can’t value it! * Nice impact of open learning; I think it should have come a bit sooner as compared to the last seconds of your speech! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Ari |
| --- |

| **Motion:** THW replace standardised testing with holistic learning in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student offered a point of information. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for a child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Speaking time: 07:43.28, good work!   * Your biggest strength is that you have excellent comedic timing; your deadpan delivery is hilarious. But you need to use it well! Keep some dramatic pauses as it helps elevate the humour. * Strong presentation and good flow! But gotta take a breath a little bit, don’t call the speakers flawed! Their arguments are, not them. * I understand what you mean when you say you need to learn how to handle stress early; firstly, don’t call it pain and hell - you don’t want to sell it like that! You want to perhaps say that people need to deal with these challenges; then, you want to make sure to explain why students can have the ability to actually handle this stress! * Try to get into the details a little bit more; for instance, when you suggest that you learn a specific skill, that skill needs to be named. For the next debate, try to focus on the unique skill you have - that skill is academic writing and academic skills! This is a completely different skill that is distinct from PBL outcomes. * Good characterisation of college; I think to make it better, you want to make sure that you are telling me why they are both so similar at least - because in my mind, college looks like a nebulous concept. You need to tell me why the skills learnt under standardised testing carries over till college! * I think you had a really good idea on college; you could actually go further to say that this really disadvantages poorer students! In the current world, you can get in on your grades - but in the propositions world, everyone is expected to have good ECA and project achievements, which is easy to get if you’re rich! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Amber |
| --- |

| **Motion:** THW replace standardised testing with holistic learning in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student offered a point of information. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for a child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Speaking time:   * Excellent start! I think you really want to lock in and start framing which issue matters the most right now * Good response to the POI! Try to make sure that the comparative is as clear as possible when you are answering the question. * I think you need a lot more focus and flow; this means that you need to get a direction in your speech that you want to get towards. This direction could be one where you suggest that one skill is more critical compared to another; it could be anything, but you need to make sure that you have this to anchor your speech to! * I feel that there was a lot of explanation on why PBL could be a good thing. This wasn't what was needed; what was needed was a comparison between the two different systems! What skill is PBL exclusively doing better compared to standardised testing? Why is that exclusivity super crucial? * How will the projects continue to develop your skills? I think you need to make sure that you are answering the why of the situation; I need more details for how the process works and goes! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Sonja |
| --- |

| **Motion:** THW replace standardised testing with holistic learning in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student offered a point of information. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for a child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Speaking time:   * Good overview at the hook! * Good call-out! I want to go deeper on the other side. For example, when you say they don’t have enough details, I need you to tell me why that is such a bad thing! * Good rebuttals in general; but it’s a bit too surface level. I need more depth for your rebuttals, you can do this by giving me at least three rebuttals for each point! Remember this is your only chance to attack the other side, you need to be devastating. * I think the callbacks to your partners are good; but you gotta frame it. This means that you need to go into depth about why the things mentioned by your partners were so helpful to begin with. E.g., telling me what the impact was and how it works! * I think that the biggest issue in this debate was that you were doing clashes, but the clashes weren’t getting resolved. A clash not being resolved in this case means that you are giving me reasons for why the stuff you are talking about is super good - but you aren’t doing the direct comparison for why your argumentation was more valuable! * I like the angle on the personal life of teachers - but remember to tell me how you are upholding that personal life and the impacts of upholding it!   Speaking time: 05:11.69, good work! | | | | | | |